ANTI-SEMITIC HATE CRIMES AND INCIDENTS REPORT



January 2016



BRUSSELS INSTITUTE

TABLE OF CONTENTS



Table of contents	3
Executive Summary	5
Action and Protection Foundation	6
Brussels Institute	6
Unity	7
About the Report	8
Methodology	10
Anti-Semitic Hate Incidents — January 2016	14
Further Anti-Semitic Hate Incidents	15
Community news and responses	16
Official and civil reasponses	18
News and opinions about anti-semitism in Hungary	19
Other news	23
Action and Protection Foundation legal actions	24
The Month's Chronicle	29
Contact and Support	31
References	32
Contributors and Publisher Information	34

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

One of the most important requirements for the struggle against anti-Semitism is an investigation of the actual prevalence of anti-Semitism. One of the aims of Action and Protection Foundation is to eliminate ignorance of this issue. Instrumental in achieving this objective is the continuous professional monitoring of hate crimes that occur public life. The community cannot really be protected unless current information on anti-Semitic acts and other hate crimes are collected and analyzed. Results of the monitoring are published, monthly by the Foundation.

The reports deal with two forms of behavior: anti-Semitic hate crimes, and hate-motivated incidents. The report refers to both types of behavior as *"hate incidents"*. An anti-Semitic hate crime is distinguished from other hate crime by possessing an anti-Semitic motive. Anti-Semitic hate crime is a violation of criminal law, not all hate-motivated acts are regarded as criminal. Nevertheless, a record of both types of hate incidents is necessary in order to gain a general overview. For the monitoring to have the widest possible scope, it is required that a variety of sources are used simultaneously. Apart from registering the incidents, it is important to record their particular characteristics. Date recorded includes the incident's location, perpetrator, victim, consequences. Also the types of the various incidents are differentiated.

In the course of its monitoring activity for January 2016, Action and Protection Foundation did not identify any anti-Semitic hate incident. The January Report does however recount numerous events tied to anti-Semitism and the Hungarian Holocaust.

In January 2016, Action and Protection Foundation filed one complaint. Facebook comments by an individual under profile name P. Z. violated the law by publically denying the crimes of the national socialist regime and contributed to incitement against a community.

ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION

....

The phenomenon of anti-Semtism is by no means new to Hungary. The hate speech encountered earlier has however become increasingly dominant in public life. The situation is further aggravated by the Jobbik Party, which openly declares anti-Semitic and racist views, having forty-three members of parliament making hate speech far more everpresent in both Parliament and other organized events. These circumstances brought Action and

Protection Foundation into being. Among the forms of civil association offered by Hungarian law, Action and Protection Foundation chose the form of foundation; it was registered in November 2012. The Foundation seeks to provide an alternative to the ineffectual legal steps taken against deteriorating standards of public discourse, exclusion, and the ignorance in which anti-Semitism is rooted, as well as atrocities and hate crimes.

BRUSSELS INSTITUTE

The Brussels Institute, founded by Action and Protection Foundation, carries out monitoring of anti-Semitic hate crime in accordance with methods worked out and proposed by the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE). In monitoring anti-Semitic phenomena the Institute records and analyzes them on the basis of information delivered by various standardized sources. The monitoring process, which categorizes incidents into seven different groups, relies on the following sources: the sources of the Institute's own Research and Incident Monitoring Group, information available in the press and public media, and relevant data to be found in judicial, criminal and other state administrative records in the framework of an agreement with these branches of government. The institute has set up a now operational HOTLINE that can be reached by dialing the number (+36 1) 51 00 000, where incidents of anti-Semitic and anti-Jewish behavior can be reported.

Beyond regular publication of the monthly monitoring reports the Brussels Institute's research plan incorporates a comprehensive research project related to Jewry—using both quantitative and qualitative methods—, as well as a survey on the current situation concerning anti-Semitism that encompasses society as a whole. Furthermore, the program includes development of a differentiated training program that prepares different levels and participants of state administration for action and appropriate procedure on racist and anti-Semitic phenomena, in the form of teaching materials for the educational system and further training.

Unity

Action and Protection Foundation is a registered civil organization. Among those actively participating in the work of the Foundation are status-quo/Chabad EMIH, the reform oriented Sim Shalom Progressive Jewish Congregation, as well as socially recognized emblematic personalities independent of these movements. Trustees of the Foundation represent the most important Jewish religious and cultural movements in Hungary, a symbolic expression of the fact that action on anti-Semitism is a cause shared by all.

ABOUT THE REPORT

Jeneral opinion on, and treatment of Hungarian anti-Semitism is often unusually extreme. Voices are heard on the one hand, that belittle the importance of such offences and manifestations. On the other hand, on occasion it may be the case that in relation to one-off incidents¹ the image registered is of a public life deluged by such incidents. Knowledge of the actual situation is an indispensable condition for treatment of the real problems, which is why Action and Protection Foundation considers it its duty to provide as comprehensive an overview of the scale of anti-Semitism in Hungary as possible. Monitoring of anti-Semitic hate crimes and incidents is one of the tools of achieving this objective. The monitoring results are published by the Foundation on a monthly basis. Apart from the monthly report, an annual summary review including more detailed analyses on the offences committed in the course of the year is also prepared.

The fight against hate crimes bears exceptional importance, because they differ from other forms of criminal conduct. These crimes may be considered messages of a kind, and thus point beyond private actions. This additional import becomes manifest in various social realms: on the level of the individual, the group attacked, and of society as a whole. The victims may suffer a greater psychological and emotional trauma. In the case of these crimes not "only" the property, or physical integrity of victims is endangered, but also their self-respect. These offences question the right of

1 See detailed definitions in the Methodology section.

the individual to equality, even of belonging to society itself. It is important that in the course of such crimes the victims are the target of attacks because of some unchangeable characteristic, and for this reason may well feel more defenseless. The victims are often afraid that they may again become victims of further atrocities. Inappropriate handling of such incidents can easily lead to a secondary victimization of the targeted person. This type of criminal act also has a strong effect on the group to which the victim belongs. The victims of such crimes are often interchangeable, because in countless cases the attack does not target a certain individual, but anyone who, in the given instance, is a member of the group under attack. In the event, members of the group also become involved emotionally, and might live in fear of the future when they themselves may become the target of such prejudice-motivated crimes. This is especially true of groups, which have been exposed to prejudice for a long time. There is no need to justify at length that Jewry belongs among such groups. These crimes violate the norm that holds the members of society equal. Inadequate handling of such incidents can have grave consequences for the whole of society. It may on the one hand, encourage the perpetrators, or even others to commit further crimes in the same mold. On the other, it significantly diminishes the cohesive power of society (Levin és McDevitt 1999, 92–93; OSCE/ODIHR 2009a, 19-21; OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 17-18; Perry 2001, 10).

It may be stated in general that fewer hate crimes are reported, and in the event documented, than are committed. Victims often do not report them to the police. A number of reasons may cause this implicitly. Firstly, many do not feel assured that the authorities will treat these incidents adequately, either because they are not sufficiently prepared, or due to prejudice. Certainly there are many victims who are not clear about the applicable legal regulations. Victims may feel shame, or fear that one of their concealed traits will be exposed. Lesser categorizations of the crimes are also frequent, where official authorities do not establish the hate-crime motivation. It is civil organizations that can help remedy these problems. Cooperation with state organs—such as the police, or the Public Prosecutor's office—may be particularly beneficial². Reports prepared by civil organizations can be expedient in alerting the official authorities to hate motivated crimes in the country. Longterm tendencies can be outlined on the basis of the collected data. Civil organizations can help in setting particular cases on track for legal process, may provide legal defense for the victims, and give various other forms of aid. These organizations may also serve as intermediaries between the victims and the police (OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 34–36).

² A great example of the above can be found in the Community Security Trust (CST) and cooperation between the London and the Manchester police forces. (CST 2013)

METHODOLOGY

The report deals with two types of offence: hate crimes and hate motivated incidents. These are defined by EBESZ as follows³ (OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 15–16):

hate crime: a crime as defined by the criminal code, which has been motivated by prejudice against a certain group of people⁴

hate-motivated incident: an offence, also based on prejudice against a certain group of people, but not reaching the level of criminal conduct.

The heightened importance of individual hate crimes is indicated by the fact that the criminal code of numerous countries deals with these cases separately. Hungarian criminal legislation identifies two forms of hate crime: violent offences committed against the member of a group, and incitement to hatred of a community. The recently adopted Criminal Code (Act C of 2012) deals with these in Chapter XXI, Paragraph 216, on crimes against human dignity and certain basic rights, as well as Chapter XXXII, Paragraph 332, on crimes against public peace. The crime of violence against a member of a group may be established if the perpetrator assaults or otherwise coerces the victim, because they belong to a protected group. Additionally, this is also the case if the perpetrator demonstrates provocative behavior against a community that is apt to cause alarm. The crime is only affected if there is a concrete victim. Incitement against a community most often means hate speech, and it can only be defined as such on the condition that it is committed in public. Incitement to hate crimes does not target concrete individuals but a group of people. It is important to add that other crimes may also be categorized as having been committed on racist motives. In such cases the courts must pass a heavier sentence⁵ (TASZ 2012, 3-4). Apart from these, Paragraph 333 of the Criminal Code also describes the crime of denial of the crimes of the National Socialist regime. Furthermore, Paragraph 335 bans the distribution and use in wide public, or public display of the symbols of various autocratic regimes among them the swastika, the SS insignia, arrowcross).

Detailed descriptions of approaches to, and recent tendencies in the definition of hate incidents can be found in our May Report. The report also cites the findings of literature in this field internationally. The present report presents hate crimes and hate incidents motivated by anti-Semitism, wherever perpetrator, target, means or message of a case

³ The scientific definition of hate crimes is extremely contradictory and divergent (for more on this, see Chakraborti and Garland 2009, 4–7). These definitions can serve as important addenda to an understanding of these crimes, however they are difficult to apply in practice. This is what made the creation of simpler, more practical definitions necessary.

⁴ For example, on these grounds the OSCE does not consider hate speech a hate crime, since the given behavior would not count as criminal without the motive of prejudice (OSCE/ODIHR 2009a, 24). For our approach in dealing with this, see below.

⁵ The Criminal Code does not include racist motives verbatim, but for example the case of "contemptible motive" is fulfilled, if someone commits a crime out of such a motivation.

suggest it. The target may be a person, a group, an event, a building, a monument or other property. It is important however, that anti-Semitic motivation can only be spoken of if the perpetrator chose the given target expressly because it was assumed to belong to Jewry. In this context it is not finally relevant whether the assumption is correct: the belief of the target's connection to Jewry is sufficient. In the course of monitoring, on one hand, all incidents that fall in the category of hate crime are considered hate incidents. These may be crimes identified as such by the Criminal Code (violent assault of a member of a community, incitement to hatred of a community, denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime, use of symbols of autocratic regimes), but can also include other acts mentioned in the Criminal Code, if prejudice can be proven as a motivating factor. When identifying hate incidents, various indicators recorded during the monitoring period⁶ are used as the basis for examining whether the given action could have been motivated by anti-Semitism.

For the widest possible scope in monitoring anti-Semitic hate incidents the simultaneous use of a variety of sources is required. The victims' filed reports are of especially great importance to this study. If the victim cannot, or does not want to file a report with the Brussels Institute, the involvement of an intermediary may be facilitated to gain information. Such an intermediary may be a family member, acquaintance of the victim, a witness of the incident or another civil organization. The earlier mentioned 24-hours-aday Hotline operated by the Foundation serves to ease the passage of reports. Additionally there are options for online filing of reports, which allow even greater anonymity for the person placing the report.

It is a declared objective of the Foundation to keep in touch with the authorities, since they are the most likely to be first approached by victims or witnesses.

A variety of media channels also represent important sources: television, radio, as well as the printed and online versions of the press. An essential segment of the report is composed of monitoring the expressions of, so called, online hatred, which seems currently to have become an ever-increasing threat.

Monitoring of these media channels is covered in part by a paid team of experts within a professional framework, while volunteers are involved additionally in the media watch, sending information gained on to the Brussels Institute for processing. It is an aim to cover an increasingly large segment of the media with continuous monitoring. Monitoring extends to roughly all receivable TV and radio stations, all the printed press with high print-runs, as well as online material not only on news portals, but the social networking pages and extreme, hate inciting websites. The monitoring process is carried through systematically, according to precisely prepared standards.

Among the monitored hate incidents there are some that are considered a part of the statistics, but there are also some that are recorded, though not counted as part of the statistics.⁷

⁶ These are described in the Methods section.

⁷ The following were used to develop these criteria: ADL 2012, CST 2013

The criteria for hate incidents that are included in the statistics follow:

- Only hate incidents that occurred in Hungary; no matter whether the victim is a Hungarian citizen or not
- Any action, incident, atrocity that is aimed at Jewish individuals, organizations or property where an anti-Semitic intent or content can be proven, or if the victim was attacked for being Jewish or due to an assumed Jewish identity
- Deliberate and wanton impairment of any Jewish institution or building (even if no further, explicit anti-Semitic message was paired with the vandalism [for example, a Jewish synagogue's window is broken with a stone])
- Anti-Semitic comments that have been reported to Action and Protection Foundation appearing on blogs, fora, community pages
- Anti-Semitic and neo-Nazi material delivered to particular Jewish individuals, Jewish organizations, institutions
- Anti-Semitic and neo-Nazi material deposited at Jewish-owned property, Jewish organizations, institutions
- Criticism related to Israel and Zionism, if they go beyond a political statement and serve to recall traditional anti-Jewish stereotypes
- Events apt to raise fear among Jews.

Hate incidents that are not accounted for in the statistics:

- Anti-Semitic hate incidents that are related to Hungary and Hungarian Jewry, but for some reason do not belong to the scope of the statistics (e.g., they did not occur in Hungary)
- Expressions of hate that appear regularly on homepages, in comments and online fora, and have not been personally reported to Action and Protection Foundation.

A number of the aspects of the registered incidents are recorded. The indicators that help decide whether a given incident was motivated by prejudice have been mentioned earlier. These indicators pertain to various characteristics of the perpetrator, data concerning the victim, the time and location of the incident. These are recorded in the course of collection of data. Tabs are kept on whether incidents had any, and if so, what sort of possibly legal—consequences.

Apart from registering incidents, it is also important to capture the qualitative differentials between them. The typification of cases is carried out in two ways. According to one of the systems of categorization the following types are differentiated: incitement against members of a community, violence against members of a community, use of symbols of autocratic regimes, and Holocaust denial.

Based on the Facing Facts! Guidelines, seven types of incidents are differentiated as follows (CEJI 2012, 10–12):

- Homicide: any attack on a person that causes loss of life
- Extreme physical violence
 - Any attack on a person that potentially causes serious bodily harm
 - Any attack involving weapons, or other tools that can cause bodily harm
- Any attack on property, where there is a potential for the people occupying the property to be killed
- Bombs and letter bombs
- Kidnapping
- Assault
- Any physical attack against a person or people, which does not pose a threat to their life and is not serious

- Attempted assault, which fails due to selfdefense, or if the victim runs away
- Throwing objects at a person or people, including where the object misses its target
- Damage to property
- Any physical attack directed against property, which is not life-threatening
- Desecration of property
- Arson attacks on property where there is not threat to life, failed attempts at arson
- Threats
- Any clear and specific threat, whether verbal or written
- Any "bomb" which is assessed to be a hoax
- Stalking
- Defamation
- Hate speech
- Public hate speech
- Hate speech channeled via the internet and social media
- Abusive behavior

- Abusive literature sent to more than one person
- In literature and music
- Discriminatory incidents

Placing hate incidents in context is also a priority. These actions do not exist in empty space and are by no means independent of the social and cultural environs in which they occur. The dynamics of these incidents is also of importance: often processes, rather than separately occurring events can be spoken of (Perry 2001, 8). Apart from the static data, short descriptions of each event are also published, which aid understanding of the environment surrounding the incident.⁸ In presenting time lines, attention will always be given to showing the dynamics of the events.

8 These descriptions in particular are held to be a most positive aspect of the Anti-Defamation League reports by Perry (2001, 18).

ANTI-SEMITIC HATE INCIDENTS January 2016



In the course of its monitoring activity for January 2016, Action and Protection Foundation did not identify any anti-Semitic hate incident.

FURTHER ANTI-SEMITIC HATE INCIDENTS

•••••

In the course of its monitoring activity for January 2016, Action and Protection Foundation identified no incidents that can be included in the statistical records either.

COMMUNITY NEWS AND RESPONSES

....

Exhibition on the culture of rural Jewry opens in Paris Paris, France Source: MTI

On 14 January, an exhibition presenting the culture of rural Hungarian Jewry opened in Paris, titled *»Picking up the Pieces—Fragments of Rural Hungarian Jewish Culture«.*

Szabolcs Takács, Minister of State for European Union Affairs and Chair of the International Holocaust Remembrance Association (IHRA), said at the exhibition's opening, *"Hungarian society positions its future in a Hungary and in a Europe where no one need be afraid, irrespective of which religious or ethnic community they belong to".*

The Minister of State said the location of the exhibition in Paris could be considered symbolic, since the largest European Jewish community lives there "and Hungary is proud that, despite the tragedy of the Holocaust, it has a vibrant Jewish cultural and religious life that has a tradition, a present, and hopefully a long future". Szabolcs Takács believes that the Hungarian government and society have a "special responsibility" to combat the wave of anti-Semitism currently sweeping through Europe, since "the Hungarian Holocaust was one of the most painful chapters in the history of the Holocaust".

Chief curator, Zsuzsa Szarvas, explained that the exhibit does not aim to present the culture of Hungarian rural Jewry comprehensively, but deliberately reflects on it in fragmentary fashion through nine selected subjects (such as the question of donation, headwear, holidays, funerary customs, and the role of light).

Liberation of the Budapest Ghetto remembered Budapest Source: MTI

On 17 January, a remembrance was held in at the Memorial Wall of the Ghetto on Dohány Street, Budapest, marking the 71st anniversary of the liberation of the Budapest Ghetto. At the remembrance organized by the Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation (EMIH). Executive Rabbi of EMIH, Slomó Köves said that 71 years ago, some of those standing among us, or relatives of those here learned from experience how terrible human failings can be, how people can be confined on the basis of their origins or their religion, and be dehumanized, the option to live, to be herded into a small part of a city like animals, and then sent off in cattle wagons to die. These people experienced the horrors and also liberation, he added. At the time, he explained, the ghetto meant physical enclosure, but we can speak of ghettos in an intellectual, spiritual sense as well. Fortunately, there are no longer ghettos in the physical sense, but in speaking about liberation, attention must also be drawn to how "we must not enclose ourselves in intellectual ghettos, not surround ourselves with walls." It should not come to pass, he continued, that we are not open enough towards the world, towards people who think differently, just as it must also never happen, that fearing what others may think we dare not speak our minds, afraid to live with our identities, to stand by our religion.

Róbert Fröhlich, rabbi of the Dohány Street Synagogue, when speaking at the remembrance organized by the Budapest Jewish Congregation in the Dohány Street Synagogue on 18 January, said that the Stars of David were removed from our coats seventy-one years ago, but their traces, their memory, their affect is *"the reality of the present"*. *"The Ghetto did not come into existence out of nothing"*, he remarked, its creation was preceded by a "*mass of laws and decrees*" enacted over a quarter of a century. Róbert Fröhlich spoke about how Jews, as long as they will live on this earth, will always remember the Holocaust, "*preserving what is good and bad*", because "*this is the kind of people we are.*" As an example he mentioned how Jewry has remembered the destruction of the Temple in Jerusalem every year for two thousand years.

OFFICIAL AND CIVIL RESPONSES

....

Man put on three-year probation Budapest Source: MTI

On 21 January, the Budapest-Capital Regional Court published a statement that the Central District Court of Pest found a man guilty of the crime of public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime.

The statement reported that, by request of the organizers, the accused had given the opening speech of a previously registered public demonstration organized by the Miklós Horthy Admirers' Circle of Friends on 17 June 2012, advertised as a Demonstration *»in Honor of Regent Miklós Horthy«.* In his speech, he quoted parts of the Imre Kertész novel Fatelessness, taken out of context, in an attempt to prove that the Holocaust never happened. In conclusion to the segments he had clipped from the novel, he stated a number of times, addressing the audience of fifty–seventy in a strident voice, *"I quote Imre Kertész: there was no Holocaust, I repeat, there was no Holocaust!"* On grounds of the above actions the Budapest District Court for the XIV. and XVI. Districts accused the man of the crime of public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime, and asked the court to give him a suspended prison sentence, the statement declares.

The accused pleaded guilty, and the jury also viewed the video of the opening speech of the demonstration. The Judge pointed out, in justification of the sentence, that the accused engaged in hate speech, and incitement to violence, yet the expert opinion of the doctor had stated that, at the time of the crime, the accused only had a limited understanding of the potential consequence of his actions.

The Court sentenced the man to three years' probation. The probation has yet to be enforced as the defense has appealed the decision, asking for an acquittal.

NEWS AND OPINIONS ABOUT ANTI-SEMITISM IN HUNGARY

•••••

International Holocaust Remembrance Day Budapest Source: MTI

A number of events were held in Budapest on International Holocaust Remembrance Day, 27 January.

The Holocaust Memorial Center and the Embassy of the State of Israel organized the event. At the event, Ilan Mor, Ambassador for Israel in Hungary, emphasized that the battle against anti-Semitism is not the cause of the Jewish people alone, but a global challenge, a battle that must be taken up by everyone, whilst "we cannot fight against something we do not understand", so the first task is to understand the causes of anti-Semitism. Ambassador Mor pointed out that the Holocaust did not begin with the concentration camps when he said that anti-Semitism and hatred based on ignorance and fear were the beginning, and Auschwitz was the consequence. On this day we remember the victims and try to understand what happened 70 years ago, when racism, prejudice and hatred ran amok, and it is important to dig out the causes and understand them for current age as well, he argued, because: for anti-Semitism to continue biting into people's souls, enflaming them with hatred of Jews, new reasons must have been found. A reason of this kind is that Jewish people are to be hated, because they support an "evil, illegitimate, murderous state", Israel. Another reason is that Jews consider their "imaginary, exaggerated suffering" the foundation for Israel-this is Holocaust denial, he explained. He added that there are politicians, people in Hungary today, who deny that the Holocaust happened, and set out to rewrite, to reinterpret the Shoah. Ilan Mor also said that a reason for anti-Semitism is the view, of some people, that Jews are trying to force the memory of their own dead onto others, thereby relegating the sufferings of the martyrs to the background. According to Ambassador Mor, it is a lesson of the dark times relevant today. He said that we must not fool ourselves saying that it could not get worse, truly "zero tolerance of intolerance is needed". He declared that Europe must understand that everyone has a responsibility to fight against anti-Semitism. It is not more memorials that are needed, but that a determined stand be taken in support of the European Jewish people. András Heisler, President of the Federation of Jewish Communities in Hungary (Mazsihisz) emphasized that not even "a little anti-Semitism" should be tolerated, and the meaning of zero tolerance, as announced by Prime Minister Viktor Orbán, is exactly that. There is a need to confront the past of Hungary in a genuine way, and no gestures should be made towards the far right, clear formulations and honest words are required.

István Mikola, Minister of State for Security Policy and International Cooperation at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade, spoke at the government remembrance event, by the Shoes by the Danube Bank Memorial, about how the remembrance carries hope of *"being able to reach people, reach their spirits by speaking earnestly about the lessons*

of history, and that through the right educational programs and good example we can teach respect for oneself and others, preparing future generations for the building of a more humane world." The absence of the many hundreds of thousands of Jews and many Roma compatriots that fell victim to the machines of murder during the genocide has been a burning wound ever since, which can be soothed to some degree only by fitting remembrance that also serves as a reminder for the future. Our weakness in those times has undermined our national identity, faith and self-confidence, he said. As he explained, the kind of value system, which was rooted in Jewish-Christian culture had strengthened the immune system of Hungarian society, and ensured its survival. The Minister of State also spoke about how the events cannot unfortunately be undone, "the pain of remembrance still throbs." "We have faced the truth of our behavior during the Holocaust, felt remorse for our actions of the time, our weakness, our betrayals, but this is not enough, we have a great deal to do in order for such horrors never to occur in a country whose strength lies in its rich variety." István Mikola clearly stated that the Hungarian state has declared zero tolerance for all manifestations of anti-Semitism. Humaneness, upholding human dignity, the value- and interest-systems of families and communities are central to government policy, but this is still not enough, because savage ideologies still threaten civilization. Slomó Köves, Executive Rabbi-Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation, spoke about how "Hungarians have their own Auschwitz here in Budapest". The Shoes by the Danube Bank remind us how easily human beings can be turned into animals, be dehumanized. "It is the irony of fate that our Auschwitz is in the city center", he noted. Also, he said that we have to remember the past, but must look into the present and the future. When we walk daily by the Danube,

we should remember the responsibility of how we can do something to stop the world turning into a place where such a thing as that which happened 70 years ago could happen.

Csaba Latorcai, Deputy State Secretary for Priority Social Affairs of the Prime Minister's Office, gave a speech at the remembrance held at the Uránia National Film Theater, on how this day was for remembrance, bowing of heads and giving respect, calling upon us to heal the visible and invisible wounds of the Shoah and the Second World War together. It is part of the healing that the renovation of a number of synagogues in Hungary and across the borders begun with the support of the government, and that a sum of one billion HUF has been allocated in this year's budget for repairs to the abandoned Jewish cemeteries, the Deputy State Secretary emphasized. Regarding the film shown that evening, he said, it draws attention to the fact that a shared responsibility sits on the shoulders of all states, governments and decisionmakers for the tragedy to never occur again. Also, he added that the government of Hungary has declared zero tolerance of anti-Semitism, racism, and exclusion, and at the same time makes a firm expression of faith in acceptance and recognition of each other. The Deputy Secretary reminded listeners that according to estimates there were six million European victims of the Holocaust, one in every ten to die was a Hungarian Jew. Menachem Margolin, General Director of European Jewish Association, said that even though 70 years have passed, it is still difficult to understand how the Holocaust could have happened. He added that we have learned a great deal from history, but not enough. In this context he emphasized the role of education, and called zero tolerance of anti-Semitism a responsibility owed by the government.

During a television broadcast, Róbert Frölich, Rabbi of the Dohány Street Synagogue, said that anti-Semitism has taken on a new face over the last decade. Interviewed on Holocaust Memorial Day, the rabbi told viewers, an anti-Israel stance is a *"clever"* conflation of the Jewish state and the Jewish people. Róbert Frölich also responded to the news that thousands of Jews had left France and moved to Israel over the last year. He commented on this as follows: *"Here in Hungary, we [...] do not feel as threatened as French Jews feel in France, Hungary is for some reason a more protected area, we do not palpably sense any form of threat to us, while of course we do worry for the rest.*"

IHRA participation at the OSCE General Assembly Vienna, Austria Source: MTI

Szabolcs Takács, Minister of State for European Affairs of the Prime Minister's Office and current Chairman of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA), spoke with reference to the 27 January International Holocaust Memorial Day at the General Assembly of the OSCE held in Vienna on 21 January.

Also, Takács said that the importance of the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) was reaffirmed by its participation at the General Assembly of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE). In an interview with MTI, he emphasized: during the period of Hungarian chairmanship, many things have happened that have once again shown clearly that anti-Semitism is present in Europe. For this reason, the General Assembly reviewed the challenges Europe has been through that lead to the appearance of the new forms of anti-Semitism, considered what IHRA and government members of the organization could help handle these phenomena. He stressed: it is certainly a shift in tone compared to previous times that a number of delegations, including those of the United States, Israel, and Canada spoke highly of the Hungarian chairmanship, as well as the decisions made by the Hungarian government last year. They gave voice to their belief that this gives credence to the Hungarian government's commitment to combating anti-Semitism.

Takács: Hungary ahead of its neighbors in education about the Holocaust New York, United States Source: MTI

On the final day of the UN event series in remembrance of the Holocaust, 29 January, a panel discussion was held at the New York headquarters of the organization on the current state and future of education about the Holocaust. Szabolcs Takács, Minister of State for European Affairs of the Prime Minister's Office, served as presenter of the discussion. He also addressed the Hungarian situation in his speech.

At the Congress, representatives of academic institutes and international organizations, researchers, pedagogues, and authors of books on the Holocaust examined the current challenges of research and education on the Holocaust, and how the training of teachers could be spread worldwide. Szabolcs Takács, who is also the current chairman of the International Holocaust Remembrance Association (IHRA), told MTI in a phone interview that his presentation dealt with general issues and the situation in Hungary as well. Regarding general concerns, he spoke about how the Holocaust is a European issue, anti-Semitism

is present in Europe to this day, and the world can witness its growth across the continent. He further clarified his assertion: anti-Semitism in the western half of Europe is of a different character than in Central-Eastern Europe. In Western Europe, it is, on the one hand, tied to Islamist radicalism and, on the other, to the trenchant criticism of Israel by radical leftist parties and movements. In contrast, the Minister of State continued, what might be called the old type of anti-Semitism can be found in Central-Eastern Europe. In answer to the question, "What can be done?", Takács repeated his emphasis on education. Education is the route to curing and eliminating this phenomenon; he said that the causes of anti-Semitism must be understood, everything that led to the Holocaust, and this requires knowledge and education, new educational methods. A great lack of knowledge is especially felt among young people.

While discussing Hungary, the Minister of State referenced the evolution of public discourse. He

said that the public discourse about anti-Semitism only began 25 years ago, at the time of regime change, since prior to that, in the countries behind the Iron Curtain, as in Hungary also, historical truth was distorted. He emphasized that the government has declared zero tolerance of anti-Semitism, and this is confirmed by the Holocaust being a part of the basic, national educational curriculum, and the decision for it to be included was during Orbán's first term at Prime Minister (1998-2002). He added that last year the enrollment in a course on the Holocaust also became a mandatory requirement for a diploma at the Pázmány Péter Catholic University. In this aspect, he proposed, Hungary is ahead of the other Eastern and Central European states. He said that for in our country the subject of the Holocaust entered the curriculum much earlier, and the course books also deal with it at much greater depth.

OTHER NEWS



There were no other news identified in January.

ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION LEGAL ACTIONS

....

Criminal proceedings for defamation filed by Dániel Bodnár and TEV, closed Budapest Source: Action and Protection Foundation

On 29 July 2014, Dániel Bodnár, a private individual, and the Foundation filed a complaint for public defamation against individuals unknown at the Central District Court of Pest. A photograph depicting Dániel Bodnár had been spreading online The photograph had an inscription: "The pestilential organism of great threat to the Hungarian nation, predator, allowed to be hunted! A Jewish terrorist living in Hungary, who operates a terrorist organization in Hungary with government permission and support." The Court informed the Foundation, in a decision dated 15 December 2014, that the two complaints will be combined under a single, private criminal case and that an investigation into the case had been ordered.

In a decision reached on 8 December 2015, the Court terminated the criminal procedure, because the investigation had not produced sufficient evidence. The social media network Facebook Inc., based in the United States of America, was not contacted. Generally, Facebook Inc. does not assist in matters regarding speech unless legally compelled to do so. The investigation was closed because the identity of the alleged suspect could not be verified. The decisions took effect on 7 January 2016. Prosecution underway in the case of a Holocaust denier Győr, Győr-Moson-Sopron County Source: Hungarian Prosecutor General's Office,

Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation filed a complaint against J.Z.A. for public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime on 15 August 2014. On 13 July 2014, the person commented on an article shared on the Foundation's Facebook page. In the comment, the person stated, "Dirty, lousy, scabby MURDEROUS JEWS, into the gas chambers with them." On 15 July another comment followed: "I am confident that the Jewish Guard is taking great pleasure in this. While all the split-dicks feel sorry for themselves for the Holohoax ... ". Another comment on 18 January 2014 said, "They are not only dirty, but anti-life and anti-human! INTO THE GASCHAMBERS WITH ALL THE JEWS!!!!!!!!!!!!!!!! A The Holocaust is also just a lie!!!!!!!". An additional comment on 17 July 2014 said, "Dirty rotten lousy small-livestock breeders scabby GYPSIES!!!! Die ALL OF YOU!!!!!!!!!!!!! Tremble, Hitler's mother is with child again !!!!!!!!!!!"

In a statement issued on 11 January 2016 the County Prosecutor's Office of Győr-Moson-Sopron Countylet it be known that the Prosecutor's Investigating Office of Győr had filed charges against J. Z. A for the repeated criminal offence of public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime. TEV requests call for legal review of a street named after József Nyirő in Balmazújváros Budapest

Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation submitted a petition to the Government Office for Hajdú-Bihar County on 25 January. The Foundation asked the office to request a legal review to rename—without delay—Nyirő József Street in the Balmazújváros Municipality.

The petition stated that according to Act CLXXXIX of 2011 on Local Governments in Hungary "no public area or public building may bear the name of a person who took part in the grounding, building, or maintenance of the totalitarian political regimes of the 20th century." The law states that it is the task of local governments to name their public areas and public buildings. The petition drew attention to the Balmazújváros Municipal Government's decree on the matter, which states that "any person memorialized through a street name must have a widely recognized field of action that is outstanding in the history of the nation and whose person is widely respected, or a life and work that has an outstanding significance in the universal history of man".

The actions of József Nyirő do not meet the requirements of the above definition. He was a member of the Hungarian National Assembly following the Arrow-Cross takeover on 3 November 1944, and the formation of the totalitarian regime of the national socialists. He participated regularly in the work of Nazi legislation. He also shouldered other responsibilities of the totalitarian political system. On the invitation of the National Association of Legislators, he produced Nazi propaganda with the newspaper »Eleven Újság« (Living news). On 31 October 1941, he spoke at the poetry day in Weimar, organized by the Third Reich. His speech was a celebration of Nazis ideology: "Europe's intellect is being given birth at this time. I am overjoyed, and Hungarian literature is overjoyed that it can also participate in this intellectual growth. I saw a beautiful picture earlier in the church, when Luther points to that saying in the bible, concerning how blood would purify us. Blood cleanses Europe. The peoples of Europe will join and come together in the spirit of peace, the soul, and the new intellectual approach. We wish to undertake this shared work with all our hearts, from the depths of our soul. Hail Adolf Hitler! Hail Germany! Hail the literary community of Germany!" In a parliamentary speech in 1942, he made similar statements: "Let those who feel alien to the Hungarian spirit get out of the way. These are the

By not changing the name of Nyirő József Street after 1 January 2013, when the amendment of specific laws in Act CLXVII of 2012 concerning the ban on names that can be tied to 20th-century totalitarian regimes came into effect, the municipal government committed a legal offense by omission. The Government Office (which provides legal rulings about the legality of local government measures) can request the local government to act, which the Foundation has petitioned for.

people who have ruined us unchecked for so long in

the fields of journalism, literature, the arts, the soul

and the spirit, in our own homelands. This approach,

this defunct liberal Jewish legacy, which has infected

many well-meaning Hungarians as well, this oblique

propaganda must disappear from Hungarian life."

TEV requests call for legal review of a street named after József Nyirő in Szigetszentmiklós Budapest Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation submitted a petition to the Government Office for Pest County on 25 January. The Foundation requested the Government Office to take measures in its capacity as authority of legal control, and issue a call for legal review in order for the Local Government of Szigetszentmiklós Municipality to change the name of Nyirő József Street without delay.

The petition stated that according to Act CLXXXIX of 2011 on Local Governments in Hungary "no public area or public building may bear the name of a person who took part in the grounding, building, or maintenance of the totalitarian political regimes of the 20th century." The law states that it is the task of local governments to give names to public areas and public buildings.

The petition detailed the activities of József Nyirő in the same way the above detailed the petition in the case of Balmazújváros, as they are not in accord with the provisions of the above-cited law.

By not having changed the name of Nyirő József Street after 1 January 2013, when the amendment of specific laws in Act CLXVII of 2012 concerning the ban on names that can be tied to 20th-century totalitarian regimes came into effect, the Municipal Government committed a legal offense by omission. The Government Office, which provides rulings regarding the legality of local government measures, can request the local government to act, which the Foundation has petitioned it to do. *TEV requests call for legal review of an alley named after József Nyirő in Kecskemét* Budapest Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation submitted a petition to the Government Office for Bács-Kiskun County on 25 January. The Foundation requested the Government Office to take measures in its capacity as authority of legal control, and issue a call for a legal review to compel the Local Government of Kecskemét Municipality to change the name of Nyirő József Alley without delay.

The petition stated that according to Act CLXXXIX of 2011 on Local Governments in Hungary "no public area or public building may bear the name of a person who took part in the grounding, building, or maintenance of the totalitarian political regimes of the 20th century." The law states that it is the task of local governments to give names to public areas and public buildings. The petition drew attention to the decree passed by the Kecskemét Municipal Government, which states that "any Hungarian person memorialized through the naming of a public place must have actively served the public good, the intellectual or material growth of the nation in exemplary fashion, and have achieved wide public recognition in their person."

The petition detailed the activities of József Nyirő in the same way as the above detailed petition in the case of Balmazújváros, as they are not in accord with the provisions of the above-cited law.

By not changing the name of Nyirő József Alley, after 1 January 2013, when the amendment of specific laws in Act CLXVII of 2012 concerning the ban on names that can be tied to 20th-century totalitarian regimes came into effect, the Municipal Government committed a legal offense by omission. The Government Office, which provides rulings regarding the legality of local government measures, can compel the local government to act, which the Foundation has petitioned it to do.

TEV filed a complaint for incitement against a community and public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime

Budapest Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation filed a complaint with the Police Department of Dabas⁹ on 25 January for incitement against a community and public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime.

The complaint reported that the following content shared by P. Z., a person with a Facebook user profile, caused incitement against a community:

On 23 November 2015, a picture was shared by the profile user, with the following inscription: *"Rule no. 1: never trust a Jew! Rule no. 2: Never turn your back to a Jew! Rule no. 3: Never spare the life of a Jew!"* The last sentence of the text is capable of provoking a reader to acts of violence against Jewry, and lays the emotional foundations for such acts.

On 25 November 2015, the person shared a photograph showing a cat with a hairstyle and moustache resembling those of Hitler. The cat's front paw got caught in the curtain at its side, so it looks like it is giving the Hitler salute. In a text bubble by its head the following can be read: *"Death to all Jews! Death to Israel!"* With this action, the

person incited violence against an ethnic group in public.



The "Nazi" cat, Source: TEV/Facebook

On 25 November 2015, the person shared a post by ZSBLOG, which bore the title: »*Brussels Chief Rabbi: "No future for Jews in Europe*" «The person shared a comment under the shared post, which read: "*Not only in Europe, but there is no place for them in the whole world, not even in the whole of the universe.. Death to them all.*"

The complaint cited a decision of the Constitutional Court from 1992 that states in regards to a person committing an act of incitement: "anyone who incites violence, encourages, provokes and agitates against an individual or group. We can speak of incitement when the voiced expressions, remarks, etc. speak not to the understanding, but intend to affect the emotional world, and are suitable to stir up anger and antagonistic passions."

The complaint argues that the comment P. Z. added to the post shared on 29 November 2015 realized the crime of public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime. P. Z. shared one of the articles of the extreme right internet portal harcunk.info, with a title *»It is permissible to deny the Armenian genocide, the European Court of*

⁹ The private individual had given Ócsa as their place of residence in the concerned Facebook profile, and this town administratively belongs to Dabas.

Human Rights has declared «. P. Z. shared the article along with the following comment: "Interesting that we are allowed to deny the Hungarian one as well. Only the Jewish Holohoax is not allowed to be denied".

In 1952, Hungary ratified the international Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of Genocide from 9 December 1948, which declares the definition of genocide as follows: "any of the following acts committed with intent to destroy, in whole or in part, a national, ethnical, racial or religious group, as such: (a) Killing members of the group; (b) Causing serious bodily or mental harm to members of the group; (c) Deliberately inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to bring about its physical destruction in whole or in part; (d) Imposing measures intended to prevent births within the group; (e) Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group." The Holocaust was the genocide planned and executed by Nazi Germany, its National Socialist government, with the aim of exterminating Jewry. The factuality of this genocide having occurred is under the protection of criminal law, the unquestionability of the fact of the Holocaust being the protected legal object of this offence. The word kamu (Hung. for hoax) means a lie. The compound expression "holokamu" (translated as Holohoax) joins the words Holocaust and kamu (or hoax), its meaning unequivocally being that the Holocaust, that is, the genocide committed by the national socialist regime, is a lie.

Information received from the Government Office for Pest County Budapest

Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Foundation filed a petition with the Government Office for Pest County on 16 December 2015. The Foundation requested the Government Office to take measures in its capacity as authority of legal control, and compel the Local Government of Vác Municipality to change the name of Hóman Bálint Street without delay.

On 28 January 2016, the Government Office of Pest County told the Foundation that, as also detailed in the submission of the Foundation, the naming of public spaces is the purview of local governments. The local government decides independently about the name of a public space under terms of its unalienable jurisdiction. The Government Office is not authorized to appraise questionable public place names. Local governments received the compulsory task of reviewing the names of their public places and bringing them into accord with laws in effect by 1 January 2013. In instances where questions arise as to whether the person a place is named after had taken part in the grounding, building or maintenance of a totalitarian political regime of the 20th century, they may turn to the Hungarian Academy of Science (Magyar Tudományos Akadémia, MTA) for a scientific expert opinion on the matter before making their decision. MTA only responds to requests regarding public place names on request of the organizations named in the regulation, such as local governments. It does not offer a statement upon request from a government office or citizen. The expert opinion of the MTA does not however have obligatory force (the possible answers being: "not recommended" and "not banned"), only serving to support the decision of the body of representatives.

According to the official information available to the Government Office, the body of representatives of Vác City Local Government is expected to discuss the question of renaming Hóman Bálint Street—based on the proposal of a representative at the regular February meeting of the body.

THE MONTH'S CHRONICLE

•••••

All the incidents to be found in the report are presented chronologically in the table below. The

Category column shows which part of the report deals with the given case in greater detail.

No.	Date	Incident	Category
1	7 January	Criminal proceedings for defamation filed by Dániel Bodnár and TEV closed	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
2	11 January	Prosecution underway in the case of the Holocaust denier	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
3	14 January	Exhibition on the culture of rural Jewry opened in Paris	Community news and responses
4	17 January	Liberation of the Budapest Ghetto remembered	Community news and responses
5	21 January	Man put on three-year probation	Official and civil responses
6	21 January	IHRA participation at the OSCE General Assembly	News and opinions about anti- Semitism in Hungary
7	25 January	TEV requests call for legal review of a street named after József Nyírő in Balmazújváros	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
8	25 January	TEV requests call for legal review of a street named after József Nyírő in	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
9	25 January	Szigetszentmiklós	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
10	25 January	TEV requests call for legal review of an alley named after József Nyírő in Kecskemét	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
11	27 January	TEV filed a complaint for incitement against a community and public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime	News and opinions about anti- Semitism in Hungary
12	28 January	Obama on the issue of the Hóman statue	Action and Protection Foundation legal actions
13	29 January	Takács: Hungary ahead of its neighbors in education about the Holocaust	News and opinions about anti- Semitism in Hungary

CONTACT AND SUPPORT

Action and Protection Foundation is the civil initiative of a number of Jewish organizations that is ready to take resolute steps to curb increasing widespread anti-Semitic manifestations.

In case anyone faces insults or anti-Semitic abuse due to a supposed or real Jewish background, do not remain silent, let us know, so that we can forward the case through the appropriate channels to the official organs required to take measures!

Notifications of such incidents are received by the Foundation through any of the following means:

HOTLINE (+36 1) 51 00 000

The website of Action and Protection Foundation: www.tev.hu/forrodrot The Facebook page: www.facebook.com/tev-tett-esvedelem-alapitvany Action and Protection Foundation's undertaking can only be successful if great numbers share in our commitment to prepare the grounds for the right to fair process for all those who have suffered offenses. In aid of this cause please support the work of the Foundation with your contribution!

Donations can be made to the Foundation on the following bank account:

13597539-12302010-00057157

Contact details for Action and Protection Foundation

Address: Semmelweis utca 19, 1052 Budapest, HUNGARY Phone: +36 1 267 57 54 +36 30 207 5130 http://www.tev.hu info@tev.hu

REFERENCES

.....

2012. évi C. törvény a Büntető Törvénykönyvről [Act C of 2012 on the Criminal Code], http://net.jogtar.hu/jr/gen/hjegy_doc. cgi?docid=A1200100.TV (last accessed: 2013.07.10.) Anti-Defamation Leaugue (ADL). 2012. 2011 Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents. CEJI. 2012. Make hate Crimes Visible. Facing Facts! Guidelines for Monitoring of Hate Crimes and Hate Motivated Incidents. Facing Facts! project. Chakraborti, Neil and Jon Garland. 2009. Hate Crime. Impact, Causes and Responses. London: Sage Publications. Community Security Trust (CST). 2013. Antisemitic Incidents Report 2012.

Levin, Jack and Jack McDevitt. 1999. "Hate Crimes." In Encyclopedia of Violence, Peace and Conflict, edited by Lester Kurtz. San Diego: Academic Press, 89–102.
OSCE/ODIHR. 2009a. Hate Crime Laws. A Practical Guide. Warsaw: OSCE/ODIHR.
OSCE/ODIHR. 2009b. Preventing and responding to hate crimes. A resource guide for NGOs in the OSCE region. Warsaw: OSCE/ ODIHR.
Perry, Barbara. 2001. In the Name of Hate. Understanding Hate Crimes. New York: Routledge.
Hungarian Civil Liberties Union (TASZ). 2012. Gyűlöletbűncselekmények áldozatainak.

2012. Gyűlöletbűncselekmények áldozatainak. Tájékoztató Kiadvány [For the victims of hate crimes. A guide]. Budapest: TASZ.

Contributors and publisher information

Publisher:	Brussels Institute Nonprofit Ltd.		
	Kálmán Szalai, Executive Director		
Editors:	Dr. Kristóf Bodó, legal advocate,		
	legal representative of Action and Protection Foundation and the Brussels Institute		
	Dr. István Fekete, legal advocate, <i>legal representative of Brussels Institute</i>		
	Kata Majoros, Communications consultant		
	Melinda Minkó research scholar,		
	head of the Incident Monitoring Group of the Brussels Institute		
	Tibor Pásztor, <i>research scholar</i> ,		
	monitoring leader of Action and Protection Foundation		
	Dr. Krisztina Szegő, lawyer		
	Balint Bethlenfalvy, translator		
Contributors:	Dániel Bodnár, philosopher,		
	Chairman of the Action and Protection Foundation Board of Trustees		
	Andrew Srulewitch, Director, Anti Defamation League		

The publisher wishes to thank Dr. András Kovács, sociologist, Professor at CEU, for all the encouragement and helpful advice.

The publishers expresses their gratitude for the self-sacrificing work of the volunteers who, under expert guidance, have put their continuous efforts into the preparation of this report over the past months.

Use of the Report or any part thereof requires written permission from the publisher and such use must properly cite this report as as a reference.

2016 Budapest

Action and Protection Foundation

Address: Semmelweis utca 19, 1052 Budapest HUNGARY Phone: +36 1 267 57 54 +36 30 207 5130 http://www.tev.hu info@tev.hu