

# **BRUSSELS INSTITUTE**

ANTI-SEMITIC HATE CRIMES AND INCIDENTS REPORT

> NOVEMBER 2013 HUNGARY

BRUSSELS INSTITUE

# ANTI-SEMITIC HATE CRIMES AND INCIDENTS REPORT

NOVEMBER 2013 HUNGARY

# CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION
Unity
Brussels Institute
ABOUT THE REPORT
METHODOLOGY
ANTI-SEMITIC HATE INCIDENTS – NOVEMBER 2013
Assault
Vandalism
Hate speech
OFFICIAL AND CIVIL RESPONSES 16
COMMUNITY NEWS AND RESPONSES
NEWS, OPINION ABOUT ANTI-SEMITISM IN HUNGARY 19
OTHER NEWS
IMPORTANT STEPS TAKEN BY ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION22
THE MONTH'S CHRONICLE
CONTACT AND SUPPORT
REFERENCES
CONTRIBUTORS AND PUBLISHER INFORMATION

# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

One of the most important requirements for the struggle against anti-Semitism is an exact awareness of the situation, that is, an investigation of the actual prevalence of anti-Semitism. It is one of the aims of Action and Protection Foundation to eliminate the lack of awareness surrounding this issue. Instrumental in achieving this objective is the continuous professional monitoring of public life. The community cannot really be protected unless current information on this is collected and analyzed. Results of the monitoring are published at regular, monthly intervals by the Foundation.

The reports deal with two forms of behavior: anti-Semitic hate crimes, and hate-motivated incidents. The report uses the term hate incidents to cover both. The decisive criterion for identifying either to be the case is anti-Semitic motive. Note however that the first type of behavior counts as criminal according to the penal law, while the latter does not make that category. Nevertheless, a documentation of both types of hate incidents is necessary in order to gain a general overview.

For the monitoring to have the widest possible scope it is required that a variety of sources are used simultaneously. Apart from registering the incidents, it is important that their particular characteristics are also accounted for. Therefore, in the course of documentation, data detailing the incident's location, perpetrator, victim and consequences are recorded on the one hand, and on the other, different types of incidents are differentiated.

Seven hate incidents were identified in November 2013. Two of these do not count as part of the statistics. One of the incidents was an assault, another vandalism and five were listed in the hate speech category. Only one of the hate incidents occurred outside the capital, and even that one took place in a county municipal center.

On the basis of its monitoring activities, Action and Protection Foundation identified seven anti-Semitic hate incidents. The hate-crime incidents are presented in according to type. Cases belongig to each group are also typified by other aspects.

Together with the Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation, Action and Protection Foundation filed for an indictment against Member of Parliament, dr. Balázs Lenhardt for incitement against a community. Two investigations were terminated, one by the police in lieu of a criminal act, the other by the court, as the identity of the perpetrator could not be established. A final ruling has also been brought however, on the basis of a complaint by Action and Protection Foundation. The accused has been penalized with a fine for a case of public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime.

# ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION

The phenomenon of anti-Semitism is by no means new to Hungary. The hate speech encountered earlier has however become increasingly dominant in public life. The situation is further aggravated by the Jobbik Party, which openly declares anti-Semitic and racist views, having forty-three members of parliament making hate speech far more ever-present in both Parliament and other organized events. These circumstances brought Action and Protection Foundation into being. Among the forms of civil association offered by Hungarian law, Action and Protection Foundation chose the form of foundation; it was registered in November 2012. The Foundation seeks to provide an alternative to the ineffectual legal steps taken against deteriorating standards of public discourse, exclusion, and the ignorance in which anti-Semitism is rooted, as well as atrocities and hate crimes.

### UNITY

Action and Protection Foundation is a registered civil organization. Participating in the work of the Foundation are leading figures from Mazsihisz, which represents the Neology and Orthodoxy, the status-quo/Chabad EMIH, the reform oriented Sim Shalom Progressive Jewish Congregation, as well as socially recognized emblematic personalities independent of these movements. Trustees of the Foundation represent the most important Jewish religious and cultural movements in Hungary, a symbolic expression of the fact that action on anti-Semitism is a cause shared by all.

# **BRUSSELS INSTITUTE**

The Brussels Institute, founded by Action and Protection Foundation, carries out monitoring of anti-Semitic hate crime in accordance with methods worked out and proposed by the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE). In monitoring anti-Semitic phenomena the Institute records and analyzes them on the basis of information delivered by various standardized sources. The monitoring process, which categorizes incidents into seven different groups, relies on the following sources: the sources of the Institute's own Research and Incident Monitoring Group, information available in the press and public media, and relevant data to be found in judicial, criminal and other state administrative records in the framework of an agreement with these branches of government. The institute has set up a now operational **HOTLINE** that can be reached by dialing the number (+36 1) 51 00 000, where incidents of anti-Semitic and anti-Jewish behavior can be reported.

Beyond regular publication of the monthly monitoring reports the **Brussels Institute's** research plan incorporates a comprehensive research project related to Jewry – using both quantitative and qualitative methods –, as well as a survey on the current situation concerning anti-Semitism that encompasses society as a whole. Furthermore, the program includes development of a differentiated training program that prepares different levels and participants of state administration for action and appropriate procedure on racist and anti-Semitic phenomena, in the form of teaching materials for the educational system and further training.

# ABOUT THE REPORT

General opinion on, and treatment of Hungarian anti-Semitism is often unusually extreme. Voices are heard on the one hand, that belittle the importance of such offences and manifestations. On the other hand, on occasion it may be the case that in relation to one-off incidents the image registered is of a public life deluged by such incidents. Knowledge of the actual situation is an indispensable condition for treatment of the real problems, which is why Action and Protection Foundation considers it its duty to provide as comprehensive an overview of the scale of anti-Semitism in Hungary as possible. Monitoring of anti-Semitic hate crimes and incidents<sup>1</sup> is one of the tools of achieving this objective. The monitoring results are published by the Foundation on a monthly basis. Apart from the monthly report, an annual summary review including more detailed analyses on the offences committed in the course of the year is also prepared.

The fight against hate crimes bears exceptional importance, because they differ from other forms of criminal conduct. These crimes may be considered messages of a kind, and thus point beyond private actions. This additional import becomes manifest in various social realms: on the level of the individual, the group attacked, and of society as a whole. The victims may suffer a greater psychological and emotional trauma. In the case of these crimes not "only" the property, or physical integrity of victims is endangered, but also their self-respect. These offences question the right of the individual to equality, even of belonging to society itself. It is important that in the course of such crimes the victims are the target of attacks because of some unchangeable characteristic, and for this reason may well feel more defenseless. The victims are often afraid that they may again become victims of further atrocities. Inappropriate handling of such incidents can easily lead to a secondary victimization of the targeted person. This type of criminal act also has a strong affect on the group to which the victim belongs. The victims of such crimes are often interchangeable, because in countless cases the attack does not target a certain individual, but anyone who, in the given instance, is a member of the group under attack. In the event, members of the group also become involved emotionally, and might live in fear of the future when they themselves may become the target of such prejudice-motivated crimes. This is especially true of groups, which have been exposed to prejudice for a long time. There is no need to justify at length that Jewry belongs among such groups. These crimes violate the norm that holds the members of society equal. Inadequate handling of such incidents can have grave consequences for the whole of society. It may on the one hand, encourage the perpetrators, or even others to commit further crimes in the same mold. On the other, it significantly diminishes the cohesive power of society (Levin and McDevitt 1999, 92-93; OSCE/ODIHR 2009a, 19–21; OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 17–18; Perry 2001, 10).

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  See detailed definitions in the *Methodology* section.

It may be stated in general that fewer hate crimes are reported, and in the event documented, than are committed. Victims often do not report them to the police. A number of reasons may cause this implicitly. Firstly, many do not feel assured that the authorities will treat these incidents adequately, either because they are not sufficiently prepared, or due to prejudice. Certainly there are many victims who are not clear about the applicable legal regulations. Victims may feel shame, or fear that one of their concealed traits will be exposed. Lesser categorizations of the crimes are also frequent, where official authorities do not establish the hate-crime motivation. It is civil organizations that can help remedy these problems. Cooperation with state organs – such as the police, or the Public Prosecutor's office – may be particularly beneficial.<sup>2</sup> Reports prepared by civil organizations can be expedient in alerting the official authorities to hate motivated crimes in the country. Long-term tendencies can be outlined on the basis of the collected data. Civil organizations can help in setting particular cases on track for legal process, may provide legal defense for the victims, and give various other forms of aid. These organizations may also serve as intermediaries between the victims and the police (OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 34–36).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A great example of the above can be found in the Community Security Trust (CST) and cooperation between the London and the Manchester police forces. (CST 2013)

# METHODOLOGY

The report deals with two types of offence: hate crimes and hate motivated incidents. These are defined by EBESZ as follows<sup>3</sup> (OSCE/ODIHR 2009b, 15–16):

- hate crime: a crime as defined by the criminal code, which has been motivated by prejudice against a certain group of people<sup>4</sup>
- hate motivated incident: an offence, also based on prejudice against a certain group of people, but not reaching the level of criminal conduct.

The heightened importance of individual hate crimes is indicated by the fact that the criminal code of numerous countries deals with these cases separately. Hungarian criminal legislation identifies two forms of hate crime: violent offences committed against the member of a group, and incitement to hatred of a community. The recently adopted Criminal Code (Act C of 2012) deals with these in Chapter XXI, Paragraph 216, on crimes against human dignity and certain basic rights, as well as Chapter XXXII, Paragraph 332, on crimes against public peace. The crime of violence against a member of a group may be established if the perpetrator assaults or otherwise coerces the victim, because they belong to a protected group. Additionally, this is also the case if the perpetrator demonstrates provocative behavior against a community that is apt to cause alarm. The crime is only affected if there is a concrete victim. Incitement against a community most often means hate speech, and it can only be defined as such on the condition that it is committed in public. Incitement to hate crimes does not target concrete individuals but a group of people. It is important to add that other crimes may also be categorized as having been committed on racist motives. In such cases the courts must pass a heavier sentence<sup>5</sup> (TASZ 2012, 3–4). Apart from these, Paragraph 333 of the Criminal Code also describes the crime of denial of the crimes of the National Socialist regime. Furthermore, Paragraph 335 bans the distribution and use in wide public, or public display of the symbols of various autocratic regimes (among them the swastika, the SS insignia, arrow-cross).

Detailed descriptions of approaches to, and recent tendencies in the definition of hate incidents can be found in our May Report. The report also cites the findings of literature in this field internationally. The present report presents hate crimes and hate incidents motivated by anti-Semitism, wherever perpetrator, target, means or message of a case suggest it. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The scientific definition of hate crimes is extremely contradictory and divergent (for more on this, see Chakraborti and Garland 2009, 4–7). These definitions can serve as important addenda to an understanding of these crimes, however they are difficult to apply in practice. This is what made the creation of simpler, more practical definitions necessary.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> For example, on these grounds the OSCE does not consider hate speech a hate crime, since the given behavior would not count as criminal without the motive of prejudice (OSCE/ODIHR 2009a, 24). For our approach in dealing with this, see below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Criminal Code does not include racist motives verbatim, but for example the case of "contemptible motive" is fulfilled, if someone commits a crime out of such a motivation.

target may be a person, a group, an event, a building, a monument or other property. It is important however, that anti-Semitic motivation can only be spoken of if the perpetrator chose the given target expressly because it was assumed to belong to Jewry. In this context it is not finally relevant whether the assumption is correct: the belief of the target's connection to Jewry is sufficient. In the course of monitoring, on one hand, all incidents that fall in the category of hate crime are considered hate incidents. These may be crimes identified as such by the Criminal Code (violent assault of a member of a community, incitement to hatred of a community, denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime, use of symbols of autocratic regimes), but can also include other acts mentioned in the Criminal Code, if prejudice can be proven as a motivating factor. When identifying hate incidents, various indicators recorded during the monitoring period<sup>6</sup> are used as the basis for examining whether the given action could have been motivated by anti-Semitism.

For the widest possible scope in monitoring anti-Semitic hate incidents the simultaneous use of a variety of sources is required. The victims' filed reports are of especially great importance to this study. If the victim cannot, or does not want to file a report with the Brussels Institute, the involvement of an intermediary may be facilitated to gain information. Such an intermediary may be a family member, acquaintance of the victim, a witness of the incident or another civil organization. The earlier mentioned 24-hours-a-day Hotline operated by the Foundation serves to ease the passage of reports. Additionally there are options for online filing of reports, which allow even greater anonymity for the person placing the report.

It is a declared objective of the Foundation to keep in touch with the authorities, since they are the most likely to be first approached by victims or witnesses.

A variety of media channels also represent important sources: television, radio, as well as the printed and online versions of the press. An essential segment of the report is composed of monitoring the expressions of, so called, online hatred, which seems currently to have become an ever-increasing threat.

Monitoring of these media channels is covered in part by a paid team of experts within a professional framework, and additionally volunteers are involved in a media watch, sending information gained on to the Brussels Institute for processing. It is an aim to cover an increasingly large segment of the media with continuous monitoring. Monitoring extends to roughly all receivable TV and radio stations, all the printed press with high print-runs, as well as online material not only on news portals, but the social networking pages and extreme, hate inciting websites. The monitoring process is carried through systematically, according to precisely prepared standards.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> These are described in the *Methods* section.

Among the monitored hate incidents there are some that are considered a part of the statistics, but there are also some that are recorded, though not counted as part of the statistics.<sup>7</sup>

The criteria for hate incidents that are included in the statistics follow:

- Only hate incidents that occurred in Hungary; no matter whether the victim is a Hungarian citizen or not
- Any action, incident, atrocity that is aimed at Jewish individuals, organizations or property where an anti-Semitic intent or content can be proven, or if the victim was attacked for being Jewish or due to an assumed Jewish identity
- Deliberate and wanton impairment of any Jewish institution or building (even if no further, explicit anti-Semitic message was paired with the vandalism [for example, a Jewish synagogue's window is broken with a stone])
- Anti-Semitic comments that have been reported to Action and Protection Foundation appearing on blogs, fora, community pages
- Anti-Semitic and neo-Nazi material delivered to particular Jewish individuals, Jewish organizations, institutions
- Anti-Semitic and neo-Nazi material deposited at Jewish-owned property, Jewish organizations, institutions
- Criticism related to Israel and Zionism, if they go beyond a political statement and serve to recall traditional anti-Jewish stereotypes
- Events apt to raise fear among Jews.

Hate incidents that are not accounted for in the statistics:

- Anti-Semitic hate incidents that are related to Hungary and Hungarian Jewry, but for some reason do not belong to the scope of the statistics (e.g., they did not occur in Hungary)
- Expressions of hate that appear regularly on homepages, in comments and online fora, and have not been personally reported to Action and Protection Foundation.

A number of the aspects of the registered incidents are recorded. The indicators that help decide whether a given incident was motivated by prejudice have been mentioned earlier. These indicators pertain to various characteristics of the perpetrator, data concerning the victim, the time and location of the incident. These are recorded in the course of collection of data. Tabs are kept on whether incidents had any, and if so, what sort of – possibly legal – consequences.

Apart from registering incidents, it is also important to capture the qualitative differentials between them. The typification of cases is carried out in two ways. According to one of the systems of categorization the following types are differentiated: incitement against

 $<sup>^7\,</sup>$  The following were used to develop these criteria: ADL 2012, CST 2013

members of a community, violence against members of a community, use of symbols of autocratic regimes, and Holocaust denial.

Based on the *Facing Facts! Guidelines*, seven types of incidents are differentiated as follows (CEJI 2012, 10–12):

- Homicide: any attack on a person that causes loss of life
- Extreme physical violence
  - $\circ\,$  Any attack on a person that potentially causes serious bodily harm
  - $\odot$  Any attack involving weapons, or other tools that can cause bodily harm
  - Any attack on property, where there is a potential for the people occupying the property to be killed
  - Bombs and letter bombs
  - 0 Kidnapping
- Assault
  - $\circ$  Any physical attack against a person or people, which does not pose a threat to their life and is not serious
  - $\odot$  Attempted assault, which fails due to self-defense, or if the victim runs away
  - $\circ\,$  Throwing objects at a person or people, including where the object misses its target
- Damage to property
  - $\odot$  Any physical attack directed against property, which is not life-threatening
  - $\circ\,$  Desecration of property
  - $\circ\,$  Arson attacks on property where there is not threat to life, failed attempts at arson
- Threats
  - $\circ\,$  Any clear and specific threat, whether verbal or written
  - Any "bomb" which is assessed to be a hoax
  - o Stalking
  - $\circ$  Defamation
- Hate speech
  - Public hate speech
  - $\circ\,$  Hate speech channeled via the internet and social media
  - Abusive behavior
  - Abusive literature sent to more than one person
  - $\circ\,$  In literature and music
- Discriminatory incidents

Placing hate incidents in context is also a priority. These actions do not exist in empty space and are by no means independent of the social and cultural environs in which they occur. The dynamics of these incidents is also of importance: often processes, rather than separately occurring events can be spoken of (Perry 2001, 8). Apart from the static data, short descriptions of each event are also published, which aid understanding of the environment surrounding the incident.<sup>8</sup> In presenting time lines, attention will always be given to showing the dynamics of the events.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> These descriptions in particular are held to be a most positive aspect of the Anti-Defamation League reports by Perry (2001, 18).

# ANTI-SEMITIC HATE INCIDENTS - NOVEMBER 2013

In the course of monitoring in November 2013, Action and Protection Foundation identified seven anti-Semitic hate incidents. Among these, one counts as assault, another as vandalism, while five have been categorized as hate speech. We present the hate crime incidents according to type. Cases belonging in a certain category are also typified in terms of other characteristics.

Location perpetrated		
Budapest	6	
County municipal center	1	
Other town	0	
Municipality	0	
N/A	0	
Level of organization		
Spontaneous	1	
Organized	4	
N/A	2	
Criminal type of incident		
Incitement against a community	6	
Assault on member of a community	1	
Denial of the Holocaust	0	
Use of symbols of autocratic regimes	0	
Type of incident		
Assault	1	
Vandalism	1	
Hate speech	5	

Table 1: Key aspects of the hate crimes, November 2013 (no. of incidents)

## ASSAULT

#### An attack on Ádám Csillag documentary film producer

### Budapest

#### Source: Hír24

The documentary filmmaker Ádám Csillag wanted to film Jobbik's Horthy memorial march on 17 November. A man started to abuse Csillag verbally on bus number 86, demanding that he stop filming and that he "go home", also threatening to "cut him down along with his ugly Jewish head". The man also pushed Ádám Csillag around for a while and switched off the camera from behind. Ádám Csillag recorded the series of events and made the film publicly available on the Youtube video sharing portal.

### VANDALISM

#### Public hanukiahs vandalized

## Budapest

#### Source: TEV, MTI, Origo.hu

The Hanukah festivities began on 28 November. An unidentified person damaged the hanukias standing on Örs vezér Square on 29 November. On 30 November three young persons damaged the Hanukkah candelabras and the signboards next to them on Blaha Lujza Square, Nyugati Square and at the Városház Park. The acts of vandalism were recorded in each instance by a surveillance camera. The hanukiahs were placed by the Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation, which entrusted representation of the case in the courts to Action and Protection Foundation.

### HATE SPEECH

#### Jew-baiting at the Horthy statue inauguration

#### Budapest

#### Source: ATV, MNO

A bust of Horthy was inaugurated at the church "Hazatérés Temploma" (church of returning home) of the Calvinist pastor Lóránt Hegedűs Jr., widely known to be anti-Semitic, on 3 November. The inaugural celebration was accompanied by an anti-demonstration joined by hundreds of people. The anti-demonstrators chanted anti-Horthy and anti-Fascist slogans during the whole inaugural ceremony, referring to the fact that as regent, Miklós Horthy collaborated with Adolf Hitler. Among those who were attending the inauguration, many shouted out anti-Semitic phrases, one participant abusing a cameraman for being Jewish and threatening him. The incident was recorded, and can be viewed on a video-sharing portal. Action and Protection Foundation has offered the cameraman assistance.

### Racist manifestations at the Békéscsaba–Debrecen NB I women's handball match

### Békéscsaba Source: MTI

Some home supporters at the Békéscsaba-Debrecen NB I womenss handball match on 16 November stretched out a banner memorializing László Csatáry, accused of war crimes, which read sVeled vagyunk, Csatáry Laci!V (We are on your side, Laci Csatáry!), that the away supporters replied to with an unmistakable Nazi salute and loud cry of Sieg heil!S The Hungarian Handball Association (MKSZ) initiated an investigation into the case immediately. The Association indicated in a press statement: the MKSZ – as any decent human being would – is shocked and ashamed at the events that unfolded, and distances itself as categorically as possible from all racist, exclusionist behavior, which has no place in a civilized world. We are no used to any such disgraceful behavior at handball matches to date, and I can promise, we will not need to!W – Iván Vetési, president of the Association commented on the events. The supporters later stated that the banner was intended as a message to an old fellow supporter, who is homeless, therefore cannot attend the matches, and is readying himself for an alcohol rehabilitation center.

### Demonstration against the "Holocaust industry" by the organization Magyar Hajnal

#### Budapest

#### Source: HVG

On 23 November, Magyar Hajnal (Hungarian dawn) held a demonstration against what it views as excessive spending on the 2014 Holocaust Memorial Year at what was once the train station of the Józsefváros in Budapest. The choice of location was deliberate, as the House of Fates Museum, which is to be a memorial to the Hungarian victims of the Holocaust, is to be built here. In addition to the Magyar Hajnal Movement, which split from Jobbik and is politically positioned further right, also protesting were the extreme right organizations, Kárpát Haza Őrei Mozgalom (Movement for the defense of the Carpathian Homeland), the Magyar Nemzet Gárda (Hungarian National Guard), and the Nemzeti Forradalmi Párt (National Revolutionary Party). The protesters number approximately 30. Antifascist protesters numbering 20–30 individuals also came to the event, disturbing the speeches from across the road with sirens.

#### Tamás Gaudi-Nagy queries a court judge about her Jewish origins

#### Budapest

#### Source: index.hu

On 29 November, Tamás Gaudi-Nagy, Member of Parliament for Jobbik, representing a defendant suspected of vandalism requested the judge presiding to submit a statement as to her possible Jewish origins "in order to ascertain partiality". The background of the event reaches back to the advocate Péter Dániel's act of drenching the statue of Miklós

Horthy with red paint in 2012, which elicited great consternation in extreme right wing circles. When later, Péter Dániel was the guest speaker of the Liberal Club, far right supporters organized a demonstration against him, and the woman whose defense is represented by Gaudi was booked by police at this demonstration. In Gaudi's opinion the family origins of the judge is important, as the man with whom his client got into a conflict with is presumably Jewish. The Judge refused Gaudi's request and initiated disciplinary proceedings against him.

#### Arrow-Cross posters on the public transportation vehicles of BKK

#### Budapest

#### Source: Action and Protection Foundation

On the basis of a photograph by one of the volunteers of Action and Protection Foundation it is possible to reconstruct that unknown individuals placed Arrow-Cross Party posters in the advertisement holders of public transportation vehicles. The act fully satisfies the criminal violation of abuse of banned symbols of autocratic regimes.

# OFFICIAL AND CIVIL RESPONSES

### Martonyi: No one denies the existence of anti-Semitism in Hungary, but the news appearing about it in the international press is exaggerated

### Jerusalem, Israel

### Source: MTI

János Martonyi, Minister of Foreign Affairs gave an interview to *Jerusalem Post*, an English language Israeli newspaper on 27 November, during his visit to Israel. In the interview he addressed the issue of anti-Semitism in Hungary with special emphasis, calling the news published about it in the international press exaggerated. Furthermore, he rejected the research results of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, which stated that among the countries of the EU, anti-Semitism is felt to be a threat by the most people in Hungary, and for this reason 48 percent of Jewish respondents are considering leaving the country.

At the same time he said that no one was denying the existence of anti-Semitism in Hungary. According to the newspaper, with allusion to the third largest party in the Hungarian parliament, Jobbik, that the phenomenon was also present on the level of politics. He went on to state that the phenomenon also exists in Europe and in other parts of the world. János Martonyi announced that his government has declared Azero tolerancez with anti-Semitism, expresses its stand on the issue unequivocally, and reacts unfalteringly to every unacceptable statementu on the issue.

# COMMUNITY NEWS AND RESPONSES

### Mazsihisz expresses shock at the Horthy statue inaugurated in Szabadság Square

#### Budapest

#### Source: MTI

On 4 November Mazsihisz expressed its shock at the Horthy statue erected in Szabadság Square two days prior. The organization, which represents Jewish interests welcomed, in the meanwhile, the civil initiative emphasizing the unacceptability of the inauguration of the statue. The expressed their confidence that "the joined forces of society, citizen participation, and determined communications from the democratic parties will together halt the advance of exclusionist ideologies".

#### Anti-Semitism showing significant growth since the appearance of Jobbik

#### Budapest

#### Source: MTI, NOL

The Evangelical-Lutheran Church in Hungary and the Norwegian Church Ministry to Israel organized a conference on 18 November titled "Anti-Semitism as a theological and social problem". Among others, the event included talks by László Donáth, Lutheran pastor, András Kovács, sociologist and Slomó Köves, Executive Rabbi of the Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation. László Donáth said that no form of tolerance can be shown towards those who incite hatred against their fellow humans. "A Christian identity cannot be substituted with hatred of Jews" – he declared. András Kovács explained: "Since the appearance of Jobbik, anti-Semitism has grown significantly, for in this period the so called 'anti-Semites in hiding', who previously thought their views were socially unacceptable now think they are presentable." Rabbi Slomó Köves spoke about how the distrust of Christian society towards Jewry had deep roots in Europe. He also stated that the Holocaust could not, and should not be allowed to be seen as the punishment of God.

# Two-day Conference in Budapest with Political Capital and the Jewish journal Szombat

#### Budapest

#### Source: MTI

On 25–26 November, Political Capital Institute and the Jewish political and cultural journal *Szombat*, held a two-day conference, "Enemies of freedom. Scapegoating ideologies, antisemitic conspiracy theories and counter-narratives" in Budapest. The British ambassador pointed out that tolerance was indispensable for any civilized society. The British ambassador declared: they support human-rights organizations, Roma and Jewish civil organization, supporting Roma farmers, also holding a book exhibition on the subject of Jewry, as well as participating in the series of events to be held next year on the occasion of the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Hungarian Holocaust.

Slomó Köves, Executive Rabbi of the Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation said, in connection with anti-Semitism it is possible to speak about the responsibilities of politicians, society and the Jewish community. He called attention to the following: the most important task of the Jewish community Snot to allow the struggle against anti-Semitism to be the only expression of their Jewishnessn. However, when they ae victims to actual or symbolic atrocities, the possibilities to stand up for themselves within the framework of the rule of law must be established – he went on to emphasize.

The writer, and chief editor of *Szombat*, Gábor T. Szántó concluded: many try to blame others for their fears, this is how a shared image of the enemy may evolve within a society.

# NEWS, OPINION ABOUT ANTI-SEMITISM IN HUNGARY

#### Protests abroad at the Horthy statue inaugurated in Szabadság Square

Washington, United States of America; Berlin, Germany; Vienna, Austria; Bratislava (Pozsony), Slovakia Source: MTI

Ronald S. Lauder, President of the World Jewish Congress (WJC) gave expression to his indignation in a press release on 4 November. "It is a historical travesty to publicly honor a man who introduced anti-Jewish laws in 1938, who sided with Adolf Hitler before and during World War II and who did nothing to prevent the murder of Hungarian Jewry" – the President of the WJC said. At the same time Ronald S. Lauder expressed his recognition of those who protested against the unveiling of the statue. He also took exception to the fact that not all the main political parties supported the protest. According to the leader of the WJC: "some Hungarian politicians seem to be concerned with their country's reputation internationally but deny that a problem exists within their country that needs to be dealt with urgently, and that is the growing anti-Semitism and racism propagated by the extreme-right". Lauder opined that anti-Semitism is a real phenomenon in Hungary. He emphasized that WJC welcomes the Hungarian government's pronouncements regarding the combating of anti-Semitism. He added however, that "words alone won't suffice".

On 5 November the *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung*, a conservative German newspaper published an article with the title "Memorial to Hitler's ally", in which the author stressed: with one "politico-historical provocation" the extreme right has made the deep divide between the national conservative Fidesz and the middle left coalition plainly visible.

On the same day the liberal Austrian paper, *Der Standard*, published Paul Lendvai,s thoughts, noting sThis Sunday in Budapest, people with such a past, their children and grandchildren were wounded, offended and fun of, through the terrifying cult of the bru-tally authoritarian Miklós HorthyT.

"The dates of historical events are very often employed, especially in Hungary, for their own short-range political interests by current political forces", the Bratislava journal UjSzó wrote also on 5 November in relation to the inauguration of the Horthy statue in Budapest. According to the author of the article titled Ut a szoborigU (What lead to the statue) Horthy is just as much of a disputed figure, as any other politician willing to sacrifice democracy, human rights, and the principle of equality before the law. H He goes on to note that while the political left and liberals view Horthy undoubtedly as a negative personality, the right is unable to form an unequivocal position regarding him. The American embassy in Budapest issued a statement on 7 November in which it strongly condemned the inauguration of the statue. The Embassy ties the organization of the shameful event to Jobbik, .a Hungarian political party identified with ethnic hatred and anti-Semitisma. The communiqué of the legation emphasized: .Those who organized and participated in the event, including members of HungaryTs Parliament, promoted not only their own intolerance, but also a dramatically negative image of Hungary.s

#### Growth of anti-Semitism nowhere as extreme as in Hungary

### Source: HVG

The European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights published data for a survey that was conducted between September and October 2012 in eight EU countries, among them Hungary. Around 90 percent of European Jewry lives in these countries. Approximately six thousand respondents were included in the statistics, however the sample, according to the statement of the FRA cannot be considered representative on the basis of the statistical criteria.

Sixty-six percent of respondents consider anti-Semitism a significant problem in their home countries. This opinion is strongest among respondents from Hungary (91 percent). Over the year preceding the survey, every fifth respondent had experienced an anti-Semitic incident in the form of verbal or physical abuse, harassment.

FRA's press release points out at the same time that there is significant difference between the countries examined. While nine percent of respondents in the United Kingdom had frequently witnessed the notion expressed that "the Jews are responsible for the economic crisis", 59 percent of respondents in Hungary had come across such a statement. The survey brought to public attention on the eve of Kristallnacht, it is also evident that within Europe, Jewry suffers the most anti-Semitism motivated abuse in Hungary

# OTHER NEWS

### A majority of articles appearing outside of Hungary do not differentiate clearly between Fidesz and Jobbik

#### Vienna, Austria

#### Source: MTI

The political scientist Fricz Tamás wrote in the conservative newspaper *Die Presse* on 22 November about what is, in his opinion, left unsaid in international press reports about Hungary concerning anti-Semitism, and how this results in a stilted view in the media. According to his approach the accusations of anti-Semitism are directed at the prime minister and his party, against society, and primarily Jobbik, but never at the left-wing opposition. In Fricz's view, "a majority of articles abroad do not differentiate clearly between the national conservative governing party, Fidesz, and the extreme right-wing Jobbik".

# IMPORTANT STEPS TAKEN BY ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION

### EMIH and TEV file for an indictment against Member of Parliament, dr. Balázs Lenhardt for incitement against a community

#### Budapest

#### Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The Unified Hungarian Jewish Congregation and Action and Protection Foundation have filed an action for the indictment of dr. Balázs Lenhardt on 11 November, as the aim of a speech he gave to an audience of hundreds at a demonstration was to heat up passions against Jews, as a religious group, to such a degree, as to make it likely that hatred against the given group becomes formative in real terms. On the basis of the above, EMIH and TEV accuse dr. Balázs Lenhardt of incitement against a community.

## Police have closed investigations in the case of the inscription "Holokamu" (Holohoax) - TEV files complaint

#### Budapest

#### Source: Action and Protection Foundation

Our *Report* for August detailed a complaint filed by Action and Protection Foundation (TEV) for the public denial of the crimes of the national socialist and Communist regimes, against a person unknown, because a sticker inscribed "Holokamu" was stuck on the van used in the city. The Budapest Police Headquarters closed the investigation in lieu of a criminal act. According to the justification the public denial of the national socialist and Communist regimes is only realized if the perpetrator denies, questions or trivializes or tries to justify the fact of it having occurred. In the opinion of the Police the inscription "Holokamu" only indicates that the person using the word refutes the historical evaluation of a circumstance related to the Holocaust, but not that he refutes the Holocaust itself.

In response, Dániel Bodnár, Chairman of the Action and Protection Foundation Board of Trustees, filed a complaint with the Prosecutor's Office on 27 November. In the complaint, on the one hand, he argued that the meaning of the word Holokamu was unequivocal. On the other hand he brought up the fact that the investigation had been ordered on the basis of an earlier complaint, and this could only be initiated on the basis of a suspicion of criminal behavior, so the investigative body had already examined the suspicion being well founded. TEV requested the continuation of the investigation.

### Court terminated procedures in the case of the complaint filed by Dániel Bodnár for defamation

#### Budapest

### Source: Action and Protection Foundation

We gave an account of the complaint filed by Dániel Bodnár, Chairman of Action and Protection Foundation Board of Trustees, for defamation on 5 August, against the extreme right wing news portal operating under the domain www.kuruc.info. The Budapest Central District Court has terminated proceedings against the offender unknown, as the investigation ordered in the case did not lead to result, as evidenced by the report of the responsible Budapest District Police 5<sup>th</sup> District Station, the identity of the offender could not be established.

### Final ruling in the case of denial of crimes of the national socialist regimes, on the basis of the complaint by Action and Protection Foundation

#### Eger

#### Source: Action and Protection Foundation

The July *Report* carries details of a complaint filed by Action and Protection Foundation against offender unknown, for denial of the crimes of the national socialist regime, incitement against a community, and the use of symbols of an autocratic regime. The Facebook user had added a comment to an article published by the extreme right news portal kuruc.info, under the title "We are looking for the Jews who harassed 97-year old uncle Csatáry (with prizes for tipoffs) – seven anti-Hungarians already identified". The District Court of Eger sentenced the offender for public denial of the crimes of the national socialist regimes, and penalized him with a monetary sum of 120,000 HUF in a final ruling.

# THE MONTH'S CHRONICLE

#### All the incidents to be found in the report are presented chronologically in the table

below. The Category column shows which part

of the report deals with the given case in greater detail.

No.	Date	Incident	Category
1.	3 November	Jew-baiting at the inauguration of the Horthy statue	Hate incident: hate speech
2.	4 November	Mazsihisz protests against Horthy statue inau- gurated in Szabadság Square with a statement	Community News and Responses
3.	4, 5, snf 7 November	International opinion about the Horthy statue inaugurated in Szabadság Square	On anti-Semitism in Hungary
4.	8 November	European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights survey on anti-Semitism across Europe	On anti-Semitism in Hungary
5.	11 November	EMIH and TEV file for an indictment against Member of Parliament, dr. Balázs Lenhardt for incitement against a community	Action and Protection Foun- dation steps taken
6.	16 November	Racist manifestations at the Békéscsaba–Debre- cen NB I women's handball match	Hate incident: hate speech
7.	17 November	An attack on Ádám Csillag documentary film producer	Hate incident: assault
8.	18 November	Conference "Anti-Semitism as a theological and social problem"	Community News and Re- sponses
9.	22 November	A majority of articles appearing outside of Hun- gary do not differentiate clearly between Fidesz and Jobbik	Other News
10.	23 November	Demonstration against the "Holocaust industry" by the organization Magyar Hajnal	Hate incident: hate speech
11.	25–26 November	Conference "Enemies of freedom. Scapegoating ideologies, antisemitic conspiracy theories and counter-narratives"	Community News and Re- sponses
12.	27 November	Foreign Minister János Martonyi's statement to the Jerusalem Post	Official and Civil Responses
13.	27 November	Police have closed investigations in the case of the inscription "Holokamu" (Holohoax) - TEV files complaint	Action and Protection Foun- dation steps taken
14.	29 November	Gaudi-Nagy queries court judge about her Jew- ish origins	Hate incident: hate speech
15.	29–30 November	Public hanukiahs vandalized	Hate incident: vandalism
16.	-	Arrow-Cross posters on public transportation vehicles	Hate incident: hate speech
17.	_	Court terminated procedures in the case of the complaint filed by Dániel Bodnár for defamation	Action and Protection Foun- dation steps taken
18.	_	Final ruling in the case of denial of crimes of the national socialist regimes, on the basis of the complaint by Action and Protection Foundation	Action and Protection Foun- dation steps taken

# CONTACT AND SUPPORT

Action and Protection Foundation is the civil initiative of a number of Jewish organizations, that is ready to take resolute steps to curb increasing widespread anti-Semitic manifestations.

In case anyone faces insults or anti-Semitic abuse due to a supposed or real Jewish background, do not remain silent, let us know, so that we can forward the case through the appropriate channels to the official organs required to take measures!

# NOTIFICATIONS OF SUCH INCIDENTS ARE RECEIVED BY THE FOUNDATION THROUGH ANY OF THE FOLLOWING MEANS:

## HOTLINE

# (+36 1) 51 00 151????

The website of Action and Protection Foundation: www.tev.hu/forrodrot The Facebook page: www.facebook.com/tev-tett-es-vedelem-alapitvany

Action and Protection Foundation's undertaking can only be successful if great numbers share in our commitment to prepare the grounds for the right to fair process for all those who have suffered offences. In aid of this cause please support the work of the Foundation with your contribution!

DONATIONS CAN BE MADE TO THE FOUNDATION ON THE FOLLOWING BANK ACCOUNT:

# $13597539 {\textbf -} 12302010 {\textbf -} 00057157$

## CONTACT DETAILS FOR ACTION AND PROTECTION FOUNDATION:

Address: Semmelweis utca 19, 1052 Budapest, HUNGARY Phone: +36 1 267 57 54 +36 30 207 5130 http://www.tev.hu info@tev.hu

# REFERENCES

2012. évi C. törvény a Büntető Törvénykönyvről [Act C of 2012 on the Crimnal Code], http://net.jogtar.hu/jr/gen/hjegy\_doc.cgi?docid=A1200100.TV (last accessed: 2013.07.10.)

Anti Defamation Leaugue (ADL). 2012. 2011 Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents.

CEJI. 2012. Make hate Crimes Visible. Facing Facts! Guidelines for Monitoring of Hate Crimes and Hate Motivated Incidents. Facing Facts! project.

Chakraborti, Neil and Jon Garland. 2009. *Hate Crime. Impact, Causes and Responses*. London: Sage Publications.

Community Security Trust (CST). 2013. Antisemitic Incidents Report 2012.

Levin, Jack and Jack McDevitt. 1999. "Hate Crimes." In *Encyclopedia of Violence, Peace and Conflict*, edited by Lester Kurtz. San Diego: Academic Press, 89–102.

OSCE/ODIHR. 2009a. Hate Crime Laws. A Practical Guide. Warsaw: OSCE/ODIHR.

OSCE/ODIHR. 2009b. Preventing and responding to hate crimes. A resource guide for NGOs in the OSCE region. Warsaw: OSCE/ODIHR.

Perry, Barbara. 2001. In the Name of Hate. Understanding Hate Crimes. New York: Routledge.

Hungarian Civil Liberties Union (TASZ). 2012. *Gyűlöletbűncselekmények áldozatainak*. *Tájékoztató Kiadvány* [For the victims of hate crimes. A guide]. Budapest: TASZ.

# CONTRIBUTORS AND PUBLISHER INFORMATION

Publisher:	Brussels Institute Nonprofit Ltd. Kálmán Szalai, executive director
Author:	Dr. Ildikó Barna, sociologist, associate professor (Habil.) at ELTE TÁTK, Department of Social Research Methodology
Editors:	Borbála Palotai, sociologist
	Dr. István Fekete, legal advocate, legal representative of Action and Protection
	Foundation
	Kristóf Bodó, legal advocate, legal representative of the Brussels Institute
	Melinda Minkó, research scholar, head of the Incident Monitoring Group of the
	Brussels Institute
	Kata Majoros, communications consultant
	Gábor Tóth, analyst
	Dr. Krisztina Szegő, lawyer
	Balint Bethlenfalvy, translator
Contributors	: Dániel Bodnár, philosopher, Chairman of the Action and Protection Foundation
	Board of Trustees
	Andrew Srulewitch, Director, Anti Defamation League

The publisher wishes to thank Dr. András Kovács, sociologist, Professor at CEU, for all the encouragement and helpful advice.

The publisher expresses its gratitude for the selfsacrificing work of the volunteers who, under expert guidance, have put their continuous efforts into the preparation of this report over the past months.

Use of the Report or any part thereof is permitted exclusively with the written agreement of the publisher and with proper reference to the source.

2013 Budapest



# **BRUSSELS INSTITUTE**

Brussels Institute Nonprofit Kft. Address: 1052 Budapest, Semmelweis utca 19. Landline: +36 1 267 57 54 http://www.brusszelintezet.hu info@brusszelintezet.hu